

Attachment 3



1
2 AB928 Associate Degree for Transfer Intersegmental Implementation Committee
3 DRAFT High-Level Recommendations
4 October 2023

5
6 This document is being publicly released in October 2023. It is meant to capture draft
7 high-level recommendations only in the spirit of creating opportunities for additional
8 feedback before the November 30, 2023 AB928 Committee meeting. The final report
9 will cover far more detail, and as a reminder the August 2023 public document entitled
10 “Findings, Considerations, and Outline Draft of Final Report Elements” also includes a
11 high level of detail, such as disaggregated baseline data by race and ethnicity, and
12 evidence and examples to support recommendations.

13 The AB928 Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT) Intersegmental Implementation
14 Committee (hereafter “AB928 Committee” and/or “Committee”) is charged in 2023
15 with making recommendations in three areas:

16 Goals: Identifying annual goals for increasing transfer rates in California and
17 closing racial equity gaps in transfer outcomes to be adopted by the state.

18 STEM: Proposing a new unit threshold for STEM degree pathways that meet the
19 requirements for admission to the California State University and the University
20 of California.

21 Reengagement: Reengaging ADT earners who do not transfer or apply for
22 transfer into a four-year postsecondary educational institution.

23 Members of the public wishing to provide comment on this draft may do so using this
24 form: <https://www.ab928committee.org/public-comment>. Public comments will be
25 publicly posted and delivered to the AB928 Committee members for their
26 consideration and discussion during public Committee meetings. Comments will not
27 be responded to individually.

28 Details about the AB928 Committee, including its meeting agendas and materials, can
29 be found at its website: <https://www.ab928committee.org/>

30

31 A. OVERARCHING RECOMMENDATIONS

32

33 Following over a year of meetings, discussion and analysis, the AB928 Committee
34 concluded that in addition to responding directly to the legislative requirements, it
35 would offer a set of overarching recommendations that create the foundation on which
36 the other recommendations rest.

37

38 The AB928 Committee calls for the following recommendations out of a strong belief
39 that increasing postsecondary attainment can improve the well-being of California’s
40 residents, fulfill the demands of the workforce, and provide fair and equitable
41 opportunity in the labor market. A robust body of research demonstrates that equitable
42 opportunities for postsecondary education deliver a variety of benefits to both
43 individuals and the state, ranging from increased tax revenues to a fulfilled workforce,
44 increased civic engagement, and social mobility.¹ Stemming from this belief in the
45 power of postsecondary education to improve the lives of Californians, the AB928
46 Committee’s recommendations seek to chart a bold path forward. The Committee
47 aspires to leave the status quo behind and achieve the maximum of what is possible
48 for the state of California and its residents.

49

50 Recommendation 1: Craft a new approach to postsecondary policymaking

51

52 As the AB928 Committee considered each legislative requirement, a recurring theme
53 emerged: the need for long-term commitment across the segments of higher
54 education in California to engage in the ongoing problem-solving required for
55 successfully removing barriers to equitable opportunities and outcomes for transfer
56 students.

57

58 The AB928 Committee recognizes that the work of achieving equity for transfer
59 students, as called for by AB928, and reaching the state’s goal that 70% of the adult
60 population will have a postsecondary credential by 2030, is not work that can be

61 ¹ McKinsey & Company. (2023). Fulfilling the Potential of US Higher Education. Retrieved August 11, 2023, from
62 <https://www.mckinsey.com/~media/mckinsey/industries/education/our%20insights/fulfilling%20the%20potential%20of%20us%20higher%20education/fulfilling-the-potential-of-us-higher-education.pdf>; Postsecondary Value Commission.
63 (2021). Equitable Value: Promoting Economic Mobility and Social Justice through Postsecondary Education. Institute
64 for Higher Education Policy and the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation. Retrieved August 11, 2023, from
65 <https://www.postsecondaryvalue.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/PVC-Final-Report-FINAL.pdf>; Trostel, P., and
66 Smith, M.C. (2017.) It’s Not Just the Money: The Benefits of College Education to Individuals and Society. University
67 of Maine and Lumina Foundation. Retrieved September 21, 2203, from
68 <https://www.luminafoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/its-not-just-the-money.pdf>; Gallup and Lumina
69 Foundation. (2023.) Education for What? Retrieved September 21, 2023, from
70 <https://www.gallup.com/analytics/468986/state-of-higher-education.aspx>

71
72

73 accomplished through legislation or through any simple solution or ‘magic bullet.’² Real
74 progress for students will be made only to the extent that stakeholders from across the
75 segments are supported to engage in the long-term work of building and maintaining
76 clear and equitable pathways for transfer students. Transfer student success is
77 everyone’s work and while there is much effort to recognize and achievement to build
78 on, there is a long road ahead that will require durable commitment to intersegmental
79 collaboration from stakeholders at every level. While a wide range of key stakeholders,
80 including faculty, staff, and administrators, are implicated in this long-term work, the
81 AB928 Committee also recognizes the necessity of ensuring effective participation of
82 students. Elevation of student voice and perspective is embedded into this ongoing
83 collaborative work.

84

85 To achieve enhanced coordination and collaboration across segments and with other
86 key statewide agencies and organizations, the AB928 Committee makes
87 recommendations in the following key areas, with additional details below:

- 88 ● Building statewide infrastructure for coordination and collaboration, with a
89 particular focus on building and resourcing the infrastructure for intersegmental
90 faculty collaboration to align curricular requirements and map transparent and
91 effective transfer pathways;
- 92 ● Aligned and streamlined resources and investments; and
- 93 ● Improved data, research and analysis.

94

95 Building statewide infrastructure for enhanced coordination across segments and with
96 other key statewide agencies and organizations: Since the dissolution of the California
97 Postsecondary Education Commission (CPEC) in 2011, California has lacked a
98 mechanism for true intersegmental coordination.³ At the moment, each segment
99 makes the majority of its own policy in siloes. Informal and voluntary venues exist, such
100 as the Intersegmental Coordinating Committee, but achieving the 70% goal will require
101 a much higher level of authority, commitment and resources. Enhanced coordination
102 across the public and private segments of California’s postsecondary ecosystem is
103 needed to fill current gaps such as:

112 ² See, for example, Office of Governor Newsom. (n.d.) “California Blueprint.” Retrieved August 1, 2023, from
113 <https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/Higher-Education-Fact-Sheet.pdf>

104 ³ Observers suggest that CPEC was dissolved due to issues with its design, such as its charge “to serve both as a
105 part of the state’s higher education infrastructure and as an objective analyst of it.” However, nearly every other state
106 in the country has a functioning coordinating or governing body for postsecondary education. An expert study is
107 needed to design a coordinating entity that learns from the lessons of the past. See for example California
108 Legislative Analyst’s Office. (2003, January). CPEC: A Review of Its Mission and Responsibilities. Retrieved August
109 1, 2023, from https://lao.ca.gov/2003/cpec/CPEC_0103.pdf; Governor’s Office of Planning and Research. (2018). The
110 Master Plan for Higher Education in California and State Workforce Needs: A Review. Retrieved August 3, 2023, from
111 https://opr.ca.gov/docs/20181226-Master_Plan_Report.pdf

- 114 ● A deep and up-to-date understanding of student learning patterns and
115 trajectories in the state of California;
- 116 ● Ongoing assessment of educational program alignment to workforce demand;
- 117 ● A shared definition of regional service areas and alignment of equitable
118 opportunity;
- 119 ● Engagement of industry to align education and training programs;
- 120 ● Deepened understanding of student affordability and collaboration with critical
121 entities such as the California Student Aid Commission (CSAC) and aligned
122 affordability efforts such as college savings accounts and Free Application for
123 Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) for All;
- 124 ● Coordination on policy analysis and action; and
- 125 ● Collaboration for implementation of legislative mandates.

126

127 If the postsecondary segments can begin to coordinate and collaborate in a new way,
128 the state can achieve a new macro-level approach to policy development, review,
129 refinement and continuous improvement. The goal is to intentionally connect the dots
130 across the magnitude of legislation, initiatives and investments in play across the state.
131 While California cannot look to another state as a “model,” many states have valuable
132 coordinating bodies in place and there are important resources that could be
133 leveraged to build the right fit for California’s context.⁴

134

135 To advance coordination and collaboration, California is in need of a resourced
136 infrastructure to support intersegmental work in a variety of areas. In particular, given
137 the focus of AB928, the Committee calls for building and resourcing the infrastructure
138 for intersegmental faculty collaboration to align curricular requirements and map
139 transparent and effective transfer pathways, including providing incentives for faculty to
140 participate in this necessary activity. This effort should leverage existing venues and
141 collaborations that stakeholders (including state government) across the state have
142 already invested time and money in, such as the Intersegmental Curriculum Workgroup
143 (ICW) and the Transfer Alignment Project (TAP). In addition, this effort should align with
144 and support the forthcoming recommendations from the [Common Course Numbering](#)
145 [Task Force](#), which similarly include a strong call for developing a process for
146 intersegmental, statewide course articulation acceptance of California Community

147 ⁴ See, for example, Pechota, D., Fulton, M., Broom, S. (2020). “50-State Comparison: State Postsecondary
148 Governance Structures.” Education Commission of the States. Retrieved August 8, 2023,
149 <https://www.ecs.org/50-state-comparison-postsecondary-governance-structures/>; Bishop, B., Heckert, K. (2022).
150 Membership Report, FY 2021. State Higher Education Executive Officers. Retrieved August 8, 2023,
151 https://sheeo.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/08/SHEEO_FY21_Membership_Report.pdf

152 College (CCC) courses that are commonly numbered (in response to [Assembly Bill No.](#)
153 [1111](#) [2021]).⁵

154

155 The AB928 Committee’s goal is to support students in transferring from “one to all,”
156 meaning the infrastructure for faculty to design pathways would seek to provide
157 students with maximum clarity and simplicity, ideally being able to easily and
158 seamlessly transfer from one college or university to all of the California public and
159 independent institutions. California is one of only 16 states that does not have a
160 statewide guaranteed transfer of an associate degree.⁶ While this is a massive
161 undertaking, starting with the highest volume majors could help to serve a significant
162 proportion of students in the short run while creating a workable process that could be
163 scaled to other majors. This is an effort that will take time, but it has been
164 accomplished in other states and there is no reason California cannot, with time, effort
165 and resources, achieve it as well.

166

167 Aligned, streamlined and leveraged resources and investments: State leaders—who set
168 the 70% attainment goal out of recognition for the ways that postsecondary education
169 can improve the well-being of California’s residents and bolster the workforce—must
170 also put in place the statewide infrastructure and resources needed to meet it. This
171 includes the physical capital, human capital and funding needed to ensure students are
172 able to take maximum advantage of the state’s rich postsecondary ecosystem.

173

174 To meet the goals as outlined in this report, the AB928 Committee calls upon each
175 segment to develop a plan for how it will increase credential production and transfer
176 attainment, while closing equity gaps, particularly by race and ethnicity, income and
177 region. The AB928 Committee recognizes that many of its recommendations will
178 require new investment. The Committee is also aware that the state currently faces
179 budgetary constraints. The Committee’s intent is not to just ask for new funding.
180 Wherever possible, the Committee encourages the segments as well as individual
181 colleges and universities to intentionally:

- 182 ● Leverage existing venues and initiatives, such as the Transfer Alignment Project;
- 183 ● Align to the evidence about what is most effective in achieving equitable
184 student outcomes, with the goal of maximizing resources available; and

189 ⁵ California State Legislature. (2021). Assembly Bill No. 1111, Postsecondary education: common course numbering
190 system. Retrieved August 2, 2023, from
191 https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=202120220AB1111

185 ⁶ Whinnery, E., & Peisach, L. (2022, July). 50-State Comparison: Transfer and Articulation Policies. Education
186 Commission of the States. Retrieved August 10, 2023, from
187 <https://www.ecs.org/50-state-comparison-transfer-and-articulation/>

188

192 ● Braid together existing funding streams. For example, the AB928 Committee
193 has a particular focus on reengaging ADT earners who did not apply for transfer
194 or transfer. Colleges and universities already have state and federal funding to
195 support re-enrolling students after the global pandemic which can be a valuable
196 resource for serving an overlapping population.

197

198 Improved data, research and analysis: The lack of an intersegmental data system in
199 California constrained the analysis that the AB928 Committee would have liked to have
200 completed. Until an intersegmental database of postsecondary student records is built,
201 the following will remain difficult or impossible to quantify, particularly as it relates to
202 persistent and pervasive inequities based on race, income, and region:

- 203 ● Start-to-finish understanding of transfer outcomes;
- 204 ● The effects of impaction/redirection;
- 205 ● Intra- and inter-regional transfer patterns;
- 206 ● Intersectional identities of transfer students and related success patterns;
- 207 ● Credits lost and repeated in the transfer process; and
- 208 ● Overall outcomes for transfer students who start at community colleges,
209 including baccalaureate graduation rate and total time to degree.

210

211 The AB928 Committee looks forward to collaborating with representatives from Cradle
212 to Career, a longitudinal data system created by [Assembly Bill 132](#) (2021), to inform the
213 development of metrics, monitoring mechanisms and dashboards related to transfer
214 and credit mobility. In that collaboration, the Committee is eager to encourage Cradle
215 to Career to appropriately and finely disaggregate data by race and ethnicity, ensuring
216 that it is possible statewide to better understand the outcomes of, for example, the
217 many subgroups of populations often grouped together as “Asian American.” Given
218 the state’s dire need for improved data as soon as possible, the Committee also calls
219 for accelerated progress toward the creation and mobilization of Cradle to Career.⁷

220

221 Relatedly, the AB928 Committee was called upon to set goals for improved and
222 equitable transfer, but the state does not have an ongoing mechanism for monitoring
223 progress against those goals. Ensuring that the forthcoming Cradle to Career
224 longitudinal data system is able to produce valuable and actionable analysis and
225 monitoring of transfer student outcomes is a priority.

226

227 In addition to establishing an intersegmental data system, a comprehensive plan to
228 meet the 70% attainment goal should be supported by a holistic analysis of factors

229 ⁷ California State Legislature. (2021). Assembly Bill No. 132, Postsecondary education trailer bill. Retrieved April 18,
230 2023, from https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=202120220AB132

231 such as regional workforce demand, in-out migration, population growth, students
232 attending out-of-state institutions, institutional capacity and changes needed by
233 particular dates to meet the goal. Such an analysis has not yet been undertaken in
234 California (there are other valuable state examples to explore to understand the
235 stakeholders engaged, data sources used and analysis conducted).⁸ The AB928
236 Committee thus calls for a comprehensive analysis of postsecondary supply and
237 demand:

- 238 • *Demand*: Collaboration with an entity that has the skills and resources to
239 conduct a comprehensive analysis of labor market needs, in- and out-migration,
240 the role of online education and out-of-state providers, transfer and other means
241 of increasing credentials to deepen the state’s understanding of what level of
242 postsecondary attainment is needed to meet the state’s economic and
243 workforce goals and ensure equitable opportunity for all California residents.
244 This analysis must paint a picture of the level and types of credentials (e.g., how
245 many Bachelor’s in Computer Science) the state needs, aligned to workforce
246 demand.
- 247 • *Supply*: A comprehensive analysis of statewide and regional capacity at the
248 existing public and private institutions of postsecondary education in California
249 to understand: the role of transfer in increasing credential attainment; which
250 institutions have additional capacity to step in to support the goal; and the role
251 of “impaction” at public universities. This analysis must have a strong regional,
252 localized focus as well as a state lens.

253

254 Recommendation 2: Holistically address equitable student success

255 As the AB928 Committee considered each legislative requirement, a recurring theme
256 was the need to knit together a range of strategies designed to close equity gaps and
257 ensure transfer student success. To close equity gaps and dramatically improve transfer
258 student success calls for intentional and holistic implementation of a range of
259 strategies. The AB928 Committee calls upon systems and institutions statewide to:

- 260 A. Address the complexity of the underlying transfer infrastructure, including
261 ensuring transfer opportunities are well-communicated to students, and
262 requiring that clear articulations of all required lower division courses are
263 publicly available and honored, to ensure students know which courses to take;

264 ⁸ See, for example, Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board. (2021). 2021 Texas Public Higher Education
265 Almanac. Retrieved August 8, 2023,
266 <https://reportcenter.highered.texas.gov/agency-publication/almanac/2021-texas-public-higher-education-almanac/>;
267 Massachusetts Department of Higher Education. (2023). Strategic Plan for Racial Equity. Retrieved August 8, 2023,
268 from
269 https://www.mass.edu/strategic/documents/Massachusetts%20Department%20of%20Higher%20Education%20Strategic%20Plan%20for%20Racial%20Equity_Updated_01242023.pdf
270

- 271 B. Scale equitable dual admission practices to give students certainty about their
272 transfer destination;
- 273 C. Create equitable access to dual enrollment programs for students while in high
274 school;
- 275 D. Ensure faculty and staff represent the diverse backgrounds of California's
276 students (including key characteristics such as race and ethnicity, income,
277 geography, gender identity and sexual orientation);
- 278 E. Provide faculty with professional development in culturally-responsive
279 pedagogy;
- 280 F. Further partner with the Association of Independent California Colleges and
281 Universities (AICCU) and its member institutions to sign Memoranda of
282 Understanding to accept and apply ADTs with their guarantees to completion,
283 as a way to address capacity and regional constraints. Explore possible support,
284 resources, and funding for these efforts, including improved marketing efforts to
285 ensure students understand the independent sector as a valuable transfer
286 option;
- 287 G. Provide additional advising services with trained professionals;
- 288 H. Provide additional career planning and support for workforce preparation;
- 289 I. Address affordability for transfer students through a collaboration with the
290 California Student Aid Commission;
- 291 J. Implement community college baccalaureate programs when relevant and
292 appropriate;
- 293 K. Expand online course offerings and increase awareness of online offerings by all
294 types of institutions including independent institutions, and ensure online course
295 and program availability is incorporated into all student-facing transfer
296 communications; and
- 297 L. Establish shared courses and programs in partnership across four-year colleges
298 and universities and community colleges in underserved regions.

299
300 The forthcoming Cradle to Career data system should be leveraged to ensure
301 intentional, ongoing monitoring of the effect of these strategies, with a particular focus
302 on their effectiveness in closing equity gaps, with data disaggregated by at least
303 race/ethnicity, income, age, program and region as well as by the credential levels and
304 types needed to meet the state's workforce demands.

305

306

307

B. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GOALS

308

309

310 The California State Legislature called upon the AB928 Committee to identify annual
311 goals for increasing transfer rates in California and closing racial equity gaps in transfer
312 outcomes to be adopted by the state. Specifically, these goals shall include all of the
313 following:

314 (A) Annual goals for improving transfer attainment needed to meet the state's
315 workforce demands;

316 (B) Goals for closing gaps in transfer outcomes by race;

317 (C) Goals for closing regional opportunity gaps to access ADT pathways; and

318 (D) Annual goals to meet the statewide degree attainment goal of 70 percent.

319

320 To that end, the AB928 Committee recommends setting the following goals for
321 California to meet state workforce needs and achieve greater educational and
322 economic equity. California lacks an intersegmental data system that supports analysis
323 of student movement across segments. As the new Cradle to Career system makes
324 better data available, we encourage an effort to revise and improve these goals.

325

326 Recommendation 1: Prioritize first and foremost closing equity gaps by race and
327 ethnicity in transfer outcomes, with ongoing monitoring of data and intentional
328 strategies aligned to achieving the following goals²:

- 329 ● By 2030, close equity gaps by race and ethnicity in the outcomes of students
330 who begin in the CCC and seek to transfer; and
- 331 ● By 2030, close equity gaps by race and ethnicity in the outcomes of students
332 who begin in the CCC and seek to apply, be admitted, enroll and graduate from
333 the University of California (UC) and California State University (CSU) systems.

334

335 Recommendation 2: To meet the state's 70% postsecondary credential attainment
336 goal, increase attainment by 2% each from the current baseline of 56% while closing
337 equity gaps by race and ethnicity to ensure all of California's residents meet the 70%
338 goal.¹⁰ To do so, and is called for in the Overarching Recommendations, increase
339 coordination, analysis, infrastructure, investments and resources to ensure California's
340 in-state public and independent institutions are able to increase access and credential
341 completion at the level needed.

342

343 As noted earlier, the state of California has a goal that 70% of the adult population,
344 ages 25-64, will have a postsecondary credential—college degree, certificate,

346 ⁹ Aligns to AB928's call for "(B) Goals for closing gaps in transfer outcomes by race."

345 ¹⁰ Aligns to AB928's call for "(D) Annual goals to meet the statewide degree attainment goal of 70 percent."

347 industry-recognized certification, or other credential of value—by 2030.¹¹ At this time,
 348 California’s postsecondary attainment rate is 56%.¹² Achieving a 14% increase in the
 349 statewide attainment rate requires seeking to achieve, and intentionally monitoring, the
 350 following annual increases:

351

Year	Attainment Rate
2023	56%
2024	58%
2025	60%
2026	62%
2027	64%
2028	66%
2029	68%
2030	70%

352

353 The AB928 Committee simultaneously calls for closing equity gaps by race and
 354 ethnicity while meeting the 70% attainment goal. All of the state’s populations should
 355 see their current attainment rates increase to 70%. The best baseline data available on
 356 current attainment rates, disaggregated by race and ethnicity, comes from the Lumina
 357 Foundation and critically only focuses on degrees (i.e., does not include non-degree
 358 certificates, etc.). We offer the following best-available baseline data to ensure that
 359 some data is being monitored while the state continues to build the Cradle to Career
 360 data system:

361

362

363

364

365

366

370 ¹¹ See, for example, Office of Governor Newsom. (n.d.) “California Blueprint.” Retrieved August 1, 2023, from
 371 <https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/Higher-Education-Fact-Sheet.pdf>

367 ¹² Most recently available data is from 2021; see Lumina Foundation. (2021). A Stronger Nation: Learning Beyond
 368 High School Builds American Talent. Retrieved April 19, 2023, from
 369 <https://www.luminafoundation.org/stronger-nation/report/#/progress/state/CA>

Racial and Ethnic Groups, California	2021 Attainment Rate, Age 25-64, Credentials included: graduate or professional degrees, bachelor's degrees, and associate degrees ¹³	2030 Goal
Hispanic	22.6%	70%
Black	38.6%	70%
Asian or Pacific Islander	66.3%	70%
White	57.3%	70%
American Indian or Alaska Native	28.5%	70%

372

373

374 Recommendation 3: By 2030, reach 100% among the cohort of students who enter the
 375 CCC, intend to transfer and meet academic qualifications, and: apply to transfer, are
 376 admitted, enroll and complete a bachelor's degree within four years of transfer at any
 377 accredited non-profit institution in- or out- of state.¹⁴

378

379 Recommendation 4: Close regional opportunity gaps to access ADT pathways, which is
 380 defined as ensuring students can transfer in their region and in the major in which they
 381 earned their ADT.¹⁵

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

394 ¹³ Short-term credentials are excluded as those data disaggregated by race or ethnicity are not available. Lumina
 395 Foundation. (2021). A Stronger Nation: Learning Beyond High School Builds American Talent. Retrieved April 19,
 396 2023, from <https://www.luminafoundation.org/stronger-nation/report/#/progress/state/CA>

392 ¹⁴ Aligns to AB928's call for "(A) Annual goals for improving transfer attainment needed to meet the state's workforce
 393 demands."

391 ¹⁵ Aligns to AB928's call for "(C) Goals for closing regional opportunity gaps to access ADT pathways."

397 C. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, ENGINEERING, AND
398 MATHEMATICS (STEM)

399

400 The California State Legislature called upon the AB928 Committee to propose a new
401 unit threshold for Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) degree
402 pathways that meet the requirements for admission to the California State University
403 and the University of California. Specifically, in regards to STEM degree pathways, the
404 recommendations shall comply with both of the following requirements:

405 (A) The recommendations shall include sufficient evidence supporting a higher
406 unit threshold for each STEM degree pathway, including an analysis of colleges
407 that have succeeded in adopting similar pathways within the 60-unit framework
408 for lower division units taken at the California Community Colleges.

409 (B) A recommendation for a differing unit threshold within a STEM degree
410 pathway shall not recommend a change of more than six units.

411

412 Caveats:

413 The legislation calls for an analysis that cannot be conducted in the absence of a more
414 robust data set. Despite the limitations, and based on data provided by the Academic
415 Senate for California Community Colleges, the following STEM programs were
416 identified as high-unit:

- 417 ● Engineering
- 418 ● Chemistry
- 419 ● Physics
- 420 ● Environmental Science
- 421 ● Math

422 Following the September 18, 2023 public meeting of the AB928 Committee, based on
423 feedback provided to the committee, the following programs were added as ones
424 possibly in need of the higher 66 unit threshold.

- 425 ● Nursing
- 426 ● Information Technology
- 427 ● Computer Science
- 428 ● Biology

429

430 It is important to note that "high-unit" is defined by the number of credits required by
431 the program, not the programs in which students accumulate the highest number of
432 credits.

433

434 Recommendation 1: Build a resourced statewide intersegmental infrastructure for
435 shared pathways development. While this is also an Overarching Recommendation, it
436 bears repeating here because it is critical for ensuring faculty collaborate to reduce the
437 units in STEM pathways. Building on what is already in place, an intersegmental
438 infrastructure for ongoing collaboration of discipline faculty must be built and
439 resourced with the goal of reducing excess credits and eliminating repetition of courses
440 in the creation of equitable STEM pathways. This infrastructure should be designed to
441 ensure that diverse and sufficiently representative faculty participation is incentivized,
442 both through the provision of resources and through formal recognition of faculty
443 participation in intersegmental curricular work in promotion and tenure.

444

445 Recommendation 2: Retain the 60-unit requirement for STEM ADTs with an option for
446 66 units upon certification of clear evidence of need. A preliminary analysis of high-unit
447 STEM programs conducted through the existing infrastructure of the Faculty Discipline
448 Review Groups (FDRGs) and informed by ongoing collaboration of discipline faculty in
449 specific programs is being conducted this fall with the goal of delivering insights and
450 recommendations to the full AB928 Committee by November. Going forward,
451 additional analysis will be needed to evaluate the pathways of STEM students to
452 understand whether they are meeting with equitable outcomes.

453

454 Recommendation 3; Allow for general education flexibility for STEM pathways. STEM
455 ADTs and TMCs need to be designed with flexibility -- intersegmental collaboration
456 should focus on building four-year pathways and then deciding how general education
457 requirements should be distributed to ensure that students are able to take all of their
458 major preparatory courses prior to transfer, which may result in some general education
459 courses being taken after transfer. Once pathways are designed by discipline experts,
460 institutions should not be allowed to 'opt out' and all requests for exceptions should be
461 made publicly and through a robustly documented process of justification.

462

463 Recommendation 4: Scale culturally responsive student supports and academic and
464 pedagogical improvements. The long-term goal of creating equitable STEM pathways
465 will be reached not only through the elimination of excess credits and unnecessary
466 course repetition, its achievement will also depend on the scaling of culturally
467 responsive, asset-minded approaches to supporting students and on the widespread
468 adoption of evidence-informed approaches to creating equitable learning
469 environments. The creation of high-quality bridge programs for both CCC students and
470 students at the public and private universities in the state is part of the work to be
471 done. Diversification of faculty representation in the FDRGs, effective student

472 participation in informing the design of programs, and a scaled commitment to
473 equity-minded pedagogy and curricular redesign are also necessary for the creation of
474 equitable STEM pathways.

475

476 D. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR REENGAGEMENT OF ADT EARNERS

477

478 The California State Legislature called upon the AB928 Committee to specifically
479 identify how to support reengaging ADT earners who do not transfer or apply for
480 transfer into a four-year postsecondary educational institution. To that end, the AB928
481 Committee makes the following recommendations to address the systemic barriers that
482 are creating obstacles for ADT earners who do not transfer or apply for transfer, with a
483 keen eye to equitably serving populations not currently served well.

484

485 Recommendation 1: Build and resource the Transfer Reengagement Initiative for
486 Associate Degree Holders (TRIAD). There is no silver bullet or single strategy that will
487 improve outcomes for ADT earners who do not transfer or apply to transfer. As such,
488 the AB928 Committee recommends building a multi-faceted plan that seeks to
489 comprehensively address the many barriers ADT earners face. Moreover, while the
490 legislation calls for reengaging students who did not transfer or apply for transfer, the
491 AB928 Committee wishes to simultaneously reduce the number of students who get
492 close to transferring and then do not do so. As such, the AB928 Committee calls for
493 the statewide Transfer Reengagement Initiative for Associate Degree Holders (TRIAD),
494 a comprehensive plan that is organized into two overarching areas of focus:

- 495 ● Strategies to reduce the number of students who get close to transfer and do
496 not transfer or apply to transfer; and
- 497 ● Strategies to reengage students who already hold the ADT and did not transfer
498 or apply to transfer.

499

500 Area of Focus 1: TRIAD—Strategies to reduce the number of students who get close to
501 transfer and do not transfer or apply to transfer:

- 502 ● *Build a universal student application process:* AB928 calls for the California
503 Community Colleges to “place students on the ADT pathway if students declare
504 a goal of transfer on their mandatory education plans.” The AB928 Committee
505 recommends that effort be combined with an effort to allow students to apply
506 for entry into the community colleges and for transfer to eligible bachelor’s
507 degree-granting institutions at the same time, through a single statewide
508 admissions portal that simplifies the admissions process, audits students’
509 completion progress, and seamlessly shares student transcripts and financial aid
510 information.

- 511 ● *Identify, monitor and make students visible:* Develop a statewide, student-level
512 data identification process that can be accessed by each UC/CSU/CCC/AICCU
513 institution to better understand who the students are who are “near the gate,”
514 meaning they have prepared for transfer, or are close to doing so, in particular
515 by pursuing completion of an ADT. This would allow institutions to directly
516 target and support their successful transfer and/or reengagement if they have
517 left without transferring or applying to do so. Ideally, each student would be
518 assigned a single, statewide student identification number, allowing for far
519 improved data systems.
- 520 ● *Streamline processes and remove unnecessary barriers:* Auto-award the ADT,
521 ensure students do not have to apply to graduate or pay graduation fees,
522 ensure institutions are not holding transcripts for student debt, and develop
523 holistic admissions processes that provide for equitable admissions.
- 524 ● *Build a regional infrastructure for coordinating admissions* (and redirecting if
525 needed) across segments to ensure placebound students can stay in their
526 preferred region.

527
528 Area of Focus 2: TRIAD–Strategies to reengage students who already hold the ADT
529 and did not transfer or apply to transfer

- 530 ● *Launch a reengagement campaign:* Establish a statewide reengagement
531 campaign that is carefully designed for success. While a strong communications
532 plan is central to this effort (and a communications plan is a legislative
533 expectation of the AB928 Committee for 2024), this campaign is far more than a
534 marketing effort. The AB928 Committee recommends it be inclusive of:
 - 535 ○ Reengagement scholarships that provide reduced or free tuition and fees
536 for returning students;
 - 537 ○ Bridge programs that support students as they reenter postsecondary
538 education;
 - 539 ○ Easily accessible coaching services so students can quickly and easily
540 receive customized support; and
 - 541 ○ Funding levers and metrics that can incentivize institutions’ focus on
542 increased student enrollment, persistence, and completion.

543
544 All of the above strategies should be continually monitored, with disaggregated
545 student outcomes data, to proactively address emerging inequities in student
546 outcomes.

547