

**THE REGENTS OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA  
MEETING AS A COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE**

November 13, 2013

The Regents of the University of California met on the above date at UCSF–Mission Bay Conference Center, San Francisco.

Members present: Regents Brown, De La Peña, Feingold, Flores, Gould, Island, Kieffer, Lansing, Makarechian, Napolitano, Newsom, Pattiz, Pérez, Ruiz, Schultz, Torlakson, and Varner

In attendance: Regents-designate Engelhorn, Leong Clancy, and Saifuddin, Faculty Representatives Gilly and Jacob, Secretary and Chief of Staff Kelman, Associate Secretary Shaw, General Counsel Robinson, Chief Compliance and Audit Officer Vacca, Provost Dorr, Executive Vice President Brostrom, Chief Financial Officer Taylor, Senior Vice Presidents Dooley and Stobo, Vice Presidents Allen-Diaz, Beckwith, Duckett, Lenz, Mara, and Sakaki, Chancellors Block, Blumenthal, Desmond-Hellmann, Dirks, Drake, Katehi, Khosla, Leland, Wilcox, and Yang, and Recording Secretary McCarthy

The meeting convened at 8:40 a.m. with Chairman Varner presiding.

**1. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chairman Varner explained that the Board had been convened as a Committee of the Whole in order to permit members of the public an opportunity to address University-related matters. The following persons addressed the Board concerning the items noted.

- A. Ms. Clara Skaug, UC Santa Cruz student and chair of the UC Students Association (UCSA) Council on Student Fees, urged the Regents to reinvest in student services, particularly in light of the recent tragedy at UC Berkeley. She said these services are not supplemental, but rather vital for students' health and well-being.
- B. Mr. Justin Cheong, an undocumented alumnus of UC Berkeley and organizer with the Coalition to Defend Affirmative Action, Integration, and Immigrant Rights and Fight for Equality by Any Means Necessary (BAMN), expressed solidarity with UC workers. He demanded the removal of Janet Napolitano as UC President because her efforts to deport undocumented immigrants were an insult to the immigrant community.
- C. Mr. David Douglass, UC Berkeley student and national organizer for BAMN, demanded the removal of Janet Napolitano as President of UC, because of her efforts to deport undocumented immigrants.

- D. Ms. Kathryn Lybarger, president of American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME) Local 3299 and lead gardener at UC Berkeley, expressed her view that the University is not taking labor negotiations seriously and has attempted to intimidate employees who advocate for worker safety. She stated that there had been a 20-percent increase in injuries among the service units on campuses and that the University had received more than \$1.5 million in patient safety fines. Ms. Lybarger said that workers are willing to compromise.
- E. Ms. Liz Negrete, employee in UC Davis Medical Center's emergency room, observed that her department is short-staffed and employees are overworked and being asked to perform duties for which they are not qualified. Ms. Negrete also stated that supervisors attempt to intimidate employees who support workers' rights.
- F. Mr. Tim Thrush, diagnostic sonographer at UCSF Medical Center for 15 years, said the University has an illegal campaign to intimidate workers who are concerned about the safety of UC's students and patients. An upcoming planned strike was to support workers' right to a workplace free from intimidation.
- G. Mr. Randall Johnson, UCSF magnetic resonance imaging technician, stated that ancillary support and assistant positions have been reduced and he must perform functions like stocking supplies and changing table dressings, reducing the time available to spend with patients and their families. The scheduled time he is able to spend with each patient has been shortened. He questioned eliminating jobs at UCSF, while executives are paid large bonuses. Patient safety is at risk.
- H. Ms. Sonia Renderos, UCLA employee, said that she was terminated after asking for needed supplies and equipment at the UCLA Guest House, although she had received positive evaluations from her supervisor.
- I. Mr. Ronald Cruz, attorney and organizer for BAMN, stated that UC has been under attack as a public institution and its President should be an academic leader who champions democratic public education for all. The selection of Janet Napolitano as President of UC was wrong and should be reversed, since she oversaw the deportation of more than two million undocumented immigrants. He expressed his view that her appointment as President was a tacit endorsement of that policy, when the majority of California's public school students are Latino.
- J. Ms. Laura Trame, who obtained her master's degree from UC Berkeley and is currently an organizer of postdoctoral researchers there, expressed concern that many postdoctoral fellows, particularly those who come from other countries with their own funding, have to pay large amounts for health insurance, which is often inadequate. Postdoctoral fellows are seeking resolution of this grievance in order to ensure that all postdoctoral researchers have adequate health insurance while they work at UC. Ms. Trame thanked President Napolitano for her public service,

for her recent speech at the Commonwealth Club, and for her recently stated commitment to secure adequate funding for postdoctoral research at UC.

- K. An undocumented student from El Salvador voiced his opposition to the appointment of Janet Napolitano as UC President. He said that students would organize against her appointment and the lack of transparency in the appointment process.
- L. Ms. Mar Vélez, a UC Berkeley graduate student, expressed discontent with the appointment of Janet Napolitano as President of UC and solidarity with UC graduate students, who work very hard to educate UC undergraduates. Graduate students struggle to support their families on very low salaries. It is becoming more difficult for low-income students to attend graduate school.
- M. Mr. Matthew Grigorieff, a UC Berkeley staff member whose work focuses on accommodations for disabled students, reported that numerous students with disabilities do not have access to their course material in a format accessible to them. As class presentations include more online content, the infrastructure is not in place to make that course material accessible to many disabled students. Mr. Grigorieff asked the Regents to make studying how this course material could be made available a higher priority.
- N. Mr. Aravind Reddy Gayam, graduate student at the Goldman School of Public Policy at UC Berkeley, stated that he spoke on behalf of the international student community. Although he had worked for three years in Silicon Valley and paid California taxes before becoming a graduate student, he is still considered a nonresident student for tuition purposes, a situation he considers unfair.
- O. Mr. Arnold Meza, a UC employee for more than 25 years, expressed concern that short-staffing is leading to an increase in employee injuries. Over time, such conditions would lead to a deterioration of the condition of the University's facilities.
- P. Ms. Sayil Camacho said she was a former undocumented student, and currently a graduate student at the UCLA School of Education and Information Studies and steward for United Auto Workers (UAW) Local 2865. Ms. Camacho urged the Regents to provide academic and professional opportunities for undocumented students.
- Q. Ms. Amanda Armstrong, UC Berkeley graduate student and member of UAW Local 2865, said she has taught undergraduate classes for eight semesters and expressed concern about the direction of the University. Tuition has been increasing and the quality of a UC education has been declining. Undergraduate class size has increased, depriving students of individual attention. Ms. Armstrong also expressed concern about UC's ability to recruit graduate students because of inadequate financial support.

**2. REMARKS OF THE CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD**

Chairman Varner welcomed President Napolitano and expressed the Board's confidence in her leadership. He commended her effort to visit all campuses.

Chairman Varner stated that he had attended the inauguration of Chancellor Dirks at UC Berkeley and was reminded of the crucial role UC plays in the lives of Californians. Chairman Varner introduced UC Berkeley Professor of Molecular and Cell Biology Randy Schekman, who won the Nobel Prize in Physiology the prior month and donated his financial prize to the University for cancer research.

Professor Schekman observed that nine of the 11 Nobel Prize recipients in natural sciences and economics were from universities in the United States. He expressed pride in representing the only public university in that group, the University of California at Berkeley. He asked why it would matter that public universities were underrepresented compared with private universities in this group. Public universities educate 70 percent of students, yet suffer from greatly diminished support from state governments and dwindling investment in basic scientific research from the federal government, in contrast with the 1960s when investment in public science education exploded. The race to space initiated by Presidents Eisenhower and Kennedy led to greatly increased federal investment in science. In California, Governor Pat Brown and UC President Clark Kerr created the California Master Plan for Higher Education that led to construction of new campuses with enough capacity to offer the best educational opportunities in the nation to the children of working- and middle-class families. Professor Schekman stated that he was a direct beneficiary of this investment, having been inspired by an undergraduate chemistry class with a Nobel laureate at UCLA. By working only a summer job during his student years, he was able to earn enough to pay his fees, room and board, and books for the full school year, and his father was able to pay very little to send five children to California colleges and universities. At that time, 80 percent of UC's budget was paid by the State, but that proportion has dwindled to approximately ten percent currently.

Great public universities continue to educate future leaders, scientists, and engineers. Professor Schekman commented that the nature of that education has evolved from a public good to a private commodity, funded to an alarming extent by burdensome personal debt. The leaders of public universities must scramble for resources to provide scholarships for students who had enjoyed an essentially free education in Professor Schekman's generation. He asked what would be the source of investment in science and research so today's public university students can continue to have a first-class education equal to one from a private institution. The nation flourishes through a unique mix of public and private universities that are the envy of the world. Professor Schekman said that he has remained a faculty member at UC Berkeley for more than 37 years, in part because public universities are the most effective engine of social mobility. The disparate investment in public and private universities represents a challenge to the nation's scientific and democratic enterprise.

Chairman Varner thanked Professor Schekman for his remarks and noted the beginning of a pilot project that would respond to students' request to increase their participation in Regents' meetings. The Committees on Educational Policy and Finance would each have a student observer who applied for the position and was recommended by the UC Student Association. The student observers would make brief remarks relevant to an agenda item in those committees.

Chairman Varner noted that the Regents would be asked to approve the UC operating budget for 2014-15. For the first time in five years, the Board would face that task with the prospect of stable State funding, thanks to the improving economy and Governor Brown's successful campaign to pass Proposition 30. Chairman Varner expressed the Board's gratitude to the Governor and the Legislature for making this reinvestment in the University a priority. Financial challenges remain. The budget that would be presented addresses the need to fund UC's ongoing mandatory costs and to begin reinvesting in its research and educational programs. Chairman Varner stressed that, as the economy rebounds, it is time to rebuild UC's quality and excellence. The Regents would also be asked to approve capital facilities funding for the current and subsequent fiscal years. In addition, an update would be provided on the successful debt restructuring program.

3. **REMARKS OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE UNIVERSITY**

President Napolitano stated that she had spent her first six weeks deeply immersed in the wonders of the University, visiting UC campuses and laboratories. She cited examples of research at UC laboratories she visited, including a UC Riverside entomology laboratory and Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, where a fuel-efficient stove is being developed that could significantly improve the lives of thousands of third-world women. President Napolitano stayed in UC Davis' West Village complex, the nation's largest planned zero net energy community. The West Village complex includes the Sacramento City College Davis Center, the only California Community College located on a UC campus, part of an effort to increase community college transfers to UC. President Napolitano reported that she also visited Oakland Technical High School where an informal show of hands indicated a widespread lack of awareness about the Blue and Gold Opportunity Plan and other financial aid opportunities.

President Napolitano stressed that the most important lesson she learned from her campus visits is that any suggestion that the University of California is wary of trying new pathways is false. She expressed her intent to push UC toward the future, while honoring its past. At every campus visit, she has been struck by the appetite for change, for moving UC forward to find better ways to serve students, advance research, and enhance UC's academic excellence. UC's traditions, born of fundamental values, must be upheld even while new approaches are tried. During a time when the science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) fields dominate, UC must continue to invest in the arts, humanities, and social sciences, the disciplines that inform the values underlying the progress sought. UC has always evolved, looking for new and better ways to pursue its public mission.

President Napolitano reported that she had already allocated \$15 million in one-time funds derived from an over-reserve in one of UC's mortgage loan programs to assist campuses in providing services for undocumented students, graduate student recruitment, and postdoctoral fellowships. She announced four new initiatives.

First, UC would begin to explore a new tuition policy. President Napolitano proposed a tuition freeze for 2014-15 to allow time to investigate options, since tuition policy is crucial to maintaining accessibility and affordability, two of UC's guiding stars. The University must find a way to bring clarity and reduce volatility in the tuition-setting process. A possible solution could be cohort tuition, where freshmen class members would enter UC with the expectation that their tuition would not dramatically increase during their four years as undergraduates. Tuition should be as low and predictable as possible.

President Napolitano reviewed data concerning the cost of attending UC for California undergraduate students, pointing out that the full price is very different from what many students actually pay. Half of undergraduates from California are fully covered by financial aid and pay no tuition; another 20 percent receive some financial aid and pay an average annual tuition of \$6,500, slightly more than half of full price. She expressed her understanding that the tuition increases of the past several years were primarily the result of two external factors: the recession and the resulting reduction in State funding. She stressed that the Regents, former President Yudof, and the chancellors did a masterful job of navigating a very difficult storm. Now that the financial environment is calmer, it is a propitious time to take a new, thorough look at UC's tuition policy. She stressed that the State must do its part. The University needs additional funding for its retirement plan and for enrollment growth. Any successful tuition policy will require a clear, predictable partnership with the State. At the same time, UC must do everything possible to reduce the cost of its operation. To that end, the Office of the President has embarked on an efficiency review initiative to identify all savings and cost avoidances it can undertake. Efficiency efforts, however, will not be enough; UC must be willing to reexamine its cost structure more generally if the University is to be kept affordable. Other revenue possibilities must be expanded, such as grants, public-private partnerships, joint ventures, and philanthropy. President Napolitano said she had asked Executive Vice President Brostrom to lead an effort to develop a clear, predictable tuition policy that UC students and their families deserve.

President Napolitano said a second initiative would be to examine UC's interaction with California Community College transfer students, who are critical to UC and to the state. She has asked Provost Dorr and the campuses in consultation with UC's academic leadership to study increasing and streamlining the flow of California Community College students who transfer to UC. The University would benefit because more students would move through more quickly without sacrificing the quality of their education. The state would benefit because opportunities would be broadened to more potential UC graduates. The main challenge would be capacity. UC would need to increase its size to accommodate these students so that transfers would not supplant high school graduates who have also earned their place. The Provost would form a team to

recommend ways to improve the transfer rate and the success of those transfer students. This team would bring a set of recommendations to the Regents at a future meeting. These could include intensified outreach to community colleges with low transfer rates or a high percentage of students from low-income families, different ways to streamline the transfer process, or expansion of programs like Summer Bridge to give entering transfer students a better chance at a strong beginning at UC. Many students begin their college education at a California Community College and yearn for the opportunity to obtain a four-year degree. UC must make that opportunity more available to all.

A third initiative would involve the University's research and the relationship of the basic research performed at UC to addressing world problems such as food scarcity, energy sustainability, and disease prevention. New innovative approaches could unleash the full potential of UC's research activities, and speed the translation of ideas and inventions developed by UC faculty, researchers, and students into products and services that can benefit all of society. UC's efforts in technology transfer have been essential to its role as a catalyst in California's innovation-based economy. President Napolitano thanked the Regents for their efforts to advance technology transfer and particularly Regent Makarechian for chairing the working group that developed a report the prior year on technology transfer. She would direct the University to identify new ways to enhance its technology transfer productivity, using the working group's report as a starting point. The University should do everything possible to streamline the process by which research efforts can lead to technology transfer by, for example, streamlining processes, supporting graduate students and world-class facilities, removing barriers that can slow the pace of technology transfer, and finding ways to invest in all areas of technology commercialization such as patents, proofs of concept, and early-stage investment in UC startups. Challenges such as identifying relevant issues and developing a system to allocate investments are not insurmountable. President Napolitano stated that she had asked Chief Financial Officer Taylor and Vice President Beckwith to develop a plan of action.

President Napolitano announced her fourth initiative, to have UC be a zero net energy consumer by 2025. In other words, the University will create as much energy as it uses, and the energy it creates and uses will be clean energy. While this is a major challenge, the University of California can lead the world in this quest, as it has in so many other areas, since it has the necessary resources in cutting-edge science and researchers, and its students are strongly committed to sustainability. In this effort, UC has the support of Governor Brown, who recently signed a clean energy pact with Oregon, Washington, and British Columbia. The need for such an initiative exists in a state whose resources are frequently overstretched and overused. The same solutions that would help UC reach this goal would help California, and President Napolitano expressed her commitment to work with state leadership on this and other sustainability efforts. Challenges will exist in maintaining research laboratories, in finding sufficient power for UC's medical centers, and in developing energy-efficient buildings for UC's increasing enrollment. Research universities like UC are in the business of breaking through such barriers.

President Napolitano conveyed her vision for the University’s enterprise: UC teaches for California and researches for the world. All of her initiatives are directed toward this overarching goal of providing education rooted in California, and research and innovation that fundamentally changes the world. If these initiatives around tuition, access for transfer students, investment in research, and energy consumption are successful, UC will again demonstrate the fundamental and unique value of a world-class public research university.

Chairman Varner expressed the support of the Board in working with President Napolitano to achieve these goals.

**4. REMARKS OF THE CHAIR OF THE ACADEMIC SENATE**

On behalf of the Academic Senate, Faculty Representative Jacob welcomed President Napolitano, adding that the Senate looks forward to engaging through shared governance and working to support her four initiatives. Mr. Jacob recalled that at the prior meeting he had discussed the crucial role of graduate students at UC and commented that external accountability measures must not distract attention from the importance of graduate education to the University.

Mr. Jacob addressed UC’s mission in teaching, research, and service. He noted that the current national focus on higher education resulted in requests to disaggregate funding for various components such as undergraduate education, graduate and professional education, research, and outreach. He cited examples of UC projects with multiple funding sources and benefitting various constituencies, showing the difficulty of separating these components. In fact, the University’s missions of teaching, research, and service are critically integrated into a successful whole.

The meeting recessed at 9:50 a.m.

.....

The meeting reconvened at 12:10 p.m. with Chairman Varner presiding.

Members present: Regents Blum, Brown, De La Peña, Feingold, Flores, Gould, Island, Kieffer, Lansing, Makarechian, Napolitano, Newsom, Pattiz, Pérez, Ruiz, Schultz, Torlakson, Varner, and Wachter

In attendance: Regents-designate Engelhorn, Leong Clancy, and Saifuddin, Faculty Representatives Gilly and Jacob, Secretary and Chief of Staff Kelman, Associate Secretary Shaw, General Counsel Robinson, Chief Compliance and Audit Officer Vacca, Provost Dorr, Executive Vice President Brostrom, Chief Financial Officer Taylor, Senior Vice Presidents Dooley and Stobo, Vice Presidents Allen-Diaz, Beckwith, Duckett, Lenz, Mara, and Sakaki, Chancellors Block, Blumenthal, Desmond-Hellmann, Dirks, Drake, Katehi, Khosla, Leland, and Wilcox, and Recording Secretary McCarthy



5. **REMARKS OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA STUDENT ASSOCIATION**

Chairman Varner called on President Napolitano, who introduced University of California Student Association (UCSA) President Kareem Aref, third-year UC Riverside student.

Mr. Aref expressed appreciation to President Napolitano for making meeting with students a high priority. The President had met with UCSA, the UC Council of Presidents, students from the Statewide Multicultural Student Coalition, and the student Regent and Regent-designate. Mr. Aref also noted the President's Napolitano's announcement of the allocation of \$15 million in non-State funds to support undocumented students, postdoctoral fellows, and graduate students. UCSA hoped to be included in discussions about the use of these funds and about ways to increase funding to UC.

Mr. Aref expressed UCSA's support for the University's commitment to raise revenue from philanthropic donations. In light of the passage of Proposition 30 and the Governor's support for no tuition increases, UCSA supports the University's current request for State funding for UC.

Mr. Aref discussed UCSA's current campaigns. The Invest in Graduation Not Incarceration, Transform Education (IGNITE) campaign supports AB 420 and SB 649. UCSA seeks the Regents' continuing support for SB 649 and urged a statement of support from the Regents for AB 420. Regarding the Fossil Free campaign, Mr. Aref expressed UCSA's hope that discussions would be held regarding divestment from fossil fuel industries. He expressed UCSA's solidarity with the American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees and the United Auto Workers and encouraged the University to bargain in good faith with these groups. UCSA hopes to work together with President Napolitano and the Board to support initiatives to improve UC.

President Napolitano commented that she will continue to meet with students to hear their concerns and move forward on initiatives. President Napolitano said the University is eager to negotiate with its labor unions and encouraged the unions to continue negotiations; students could have a positive role by encouraging the unions to remain at the negotiating table until an agreement is reached.

Regent Pérez expressed his view that President Napolitano has taken important steps in an attempt to reach agreements with labor unions.

The meeting adjourned at 12:15 p.m.

Attest:

Secretary and Chief of Staff